Annotated Bibliography for Hybrid Security in the European Union – Sezen Kaya (ed.)

Introduction – Sezen Kaya

Security had been evaluated from a narrow perspective until the end of the 1980s and early 1990s. However, the concept of security has evolved after the Cold War with the emergence of new threats, such as migration, economic, health, and environmental problems. Hence, improvements in the international system have extended the understanding of security. In this context, this reading list offers an understanding of various threats to the EU. Thus, the readings on **Hybrid Security in the European Union (EU)** present a comprehensive approach to the security issue which the EU has faced since the Cold War era. The readings are shaped by broad content from terrorism and political violence, human security issues, military threat, migration, border security, disinformation, cybersecurity, economic security to ecological security. The main hybrid threats to the EU are conceptualized through the crucial readings in the literature. Moreover, it is expected to utilize the main document, such as the European Security Strategy and Global Strategy of the EU, to understand the EU's approach to the hybrid threats. Thus, it will provide an overview in depth-analysis of security issues in the EU. In particular, the readings will illustrate the underlying reasons of the issue to be presented as a hybrid threat, the impacts and the content of the threat, and the EU's response to these threats. In this framework, the readings aim to provide an all-around framework on how the European Union has problematized security issues after the Cold War era.

The readings summarize different perspectives of hybrid threats in the context of the EU. For example, with the readings of terrorism and political violence, causes of terrorism, measurements are taken by the European Union against terrorism, and counterterrorism strategy of the EU are examined. Besides, the place of human security in the EU's security understanding and security discourse of the EU in the context of human security are analyzed. Furthermore, while the definition of military security and evolution of the concept are examined within the military threats, migration and security issues and the relationship between these two concepts are analyzed in the readings of migration-security nexus. On the other hand, the role of disinformation as a threat, the negative effects of disinformation, and the reaction of the EU against the disinformation campaigns are highlighted with the critical readings in the literature. Moreover, understanding border and border security and the evolution of border security are emphasized with the essential readings on this issue. Besides, ecological security and its perception within the EU and the emergence

of climate change as an environmental security issue are summarized with the key readings on this issue. Finally, the concept of cybersecurity and EU's policies and strategies on this issue and the emergence of economic security and approaches of the EU is emphasized with the significant readings in the literature. In this framework, these readings aim to demonstrate the challenges, especially hybrid threats, to European security and the EU's responses to the challenges from a conceptual perspective.

***** ***** ***** *****

1. Terrorism and Political Violence in Europe – Şeyma Nur Genç

Andreeva, Christine. "The EU's counter-terrorism policy after 2015-"Europe wasn't ready"-"but it has proven that it's adaptable." *Era Forum* **20, no. 3 (2020): 343-70.**

In this article, Andreeva highlights the development of the EU's counter-terrorism policy between 2015 and 2019 by acknowledging previous deficiencies in the preparation process to tackle jihadist terrorism. It discusses the effectiveness of measurements taken by the EU against terrorist threats under different strategies and issue areas. She concludes that the reforms made have a very positive effect and seem permanent since they are functional in filling the governance gaps.

Badey, Thomas J. "Defining International Terrorism: A Pragmatic Approach." *Terrorism and Political Violence* **10, no. 1 (1998): 90-107.**

The article's focal point is the absence of a commonly agreed definition of terrorism. Since there is an incompatibility between academic and political definitions, the paper claims to provide a clear and functional definition without excluding both fields. It defines terrorism by focusing on its fundamental hallmarks as repetition, motivation, intent, actors, and effect. He also concludes that the definitional question must be resolved by the additional factors to deal with the impacts of international terrorism.

Crenshaw, Martha. "The Causes of Terrorism." *Comparative Politics* **13, no. 4 (1981): 379–99.**

In the article, Crenshaw introduces an approach to examine the causes of terrorism by offering several empirical examples. The article considers terrorists as rational actors without ignoring the psychological factors. However, the main focus is on the rationale of the terrorists with the considerations of preconditions and precipitant factors in the occurrence of terrorism.

Kaunert, Christian, and Sarah Léonard. "The Collective Securitization of Terrorism in The European Union." *West European Politics* **42, no. 2 (2019): 261-77.**

Kaunert and Léonard examine the EU's process in accepting terrorism as a common threat by the 9/11 attack. Hence, the formation of a shared perspective and the increase in the level of cooperation with institutions is analyzed. The emphasis is put on the growing cooperation between European states in the case of counter-terrorism by employing the concept of "collective security."

Keohane, Daniel. *The EU and Counter-terrorism.* **London: Centre for European Reform, 2005.**

Keohane provides a general inclusive framework about the counterterrorism

strategy of the EU with possible threats. In this article, the central puzzle is the dilemma that, on the one hand, the member states of the EU need to cooperate with each other to pursue effective counterterrorism strategy; on the other hand, they are not willing to share their powers with the higher authority, the Union. He mainly states that the EU member states ought to pursue an agreed strategy for a common goal.

Müller-Wille, Bjorn. "The Effect of International Terrorism on EU Intelligence Cooperation."*Journal of Common Market Studies* 46, no 1 (2008): 49-73.

The article examines why international terrorism has an inconsiderable impact on the EU intelligence cooperation by applying a functionalist approach. Müller-Wille mainly asserts that the tactical and functional role of cooperation is much more suitable for national authorities than the EU since they are responsible units for pursuing effective counter-terrorism policies within the country's borders. Furthermore, he also underlines the EU's usefulness as an intermediary organization contributing to the knowledge-sharing process between national governments.

Schmid, Alex P. "The response problem as a definition problem." *Terrorism and Political Violence*4, no. 4 (1992): 7-13.

In this article, Schmid deals with the difficulties in responding to terrorism due to the lack of a commonly accepted definition of terrorism. To solve this issue, he suggests defining terrorism in the war crimes framework, which transfers the discussion to the discourse field, in which there is a much worldwide consensus. Hence, a definition with more concrete limits and more consensus will be reached for responding to terrorism.

Wiener, Antje. "European Responses to International Terrorism: Diversity Awareness as a New Capability?." *Journal of Common Market Studies* 46,

no. 1 (2008): 195-218.

By employing a contextualized approach, considering conditions under which strategic policies formed, Wiener interprets the European Union's capacity in dealing with possible terrorist threats. In this theory-driven study, she introduces distinct European capabilities, which refer to the enforcement power in transnational and trans-border issues. Finally, she concludes that the critical point of tackling terrorism is to have a common agreement on the negotiators' interest and their understanding of the norms binding their decisions.

***** ***** ***** *****

2. Issues of Human Security in Europe – *Rabia İnleyen*

Albrecht, Ulrich, Christine Chinkin, Kemal Dervis, Renata Dwan, Anthony Giddens, Nicole Gnesotto, Mary Kaldor, et al. "A Human Security Doctrine for Europe: the Barcelona Report of the Study Group on Europe's Security Capabilities." The report presented to EU High Representative for Common Foreign and Security Policy Javier Solana, Barcelona, September 15, 2004. http://eprints.lse.ac.uk/40209/1/A_human_security_doctrine_for_Europe%28author%29.pdf.

This report is a key document on human security through the lenses of the European Union, and it explains why human security is important for the EU's security understanding. It covers several aspects of human security, and it shows how human security can pave the way for a new security doctrine for Europe.

Therefore, the report is a must-read and a common source for research on human security.

Burgess, J. Peter, and Shahrbanou Tadjbakhsh. "The Human Security Tale of Two Europes." *Global Society* **24, no. 4 (2010): 447–65.**

This work has shown that the European Union is not only a crucial actor in external affairs but also its security policy has many impacts on Eastern Europeans as well. The author explains the human security dilemma on two sides of Europe and emphasizes how to achieve a well-grounded foreign policy on human security without strengthening it within the European borders.

Christou, George. "The European Union's Human Security Discourse: Where Are We Now?." *European Security* **23, no. 3 (2014): 364–81.**

This article presents the data of the EU's contemporary security discourse features and the extent to which it has covered human security. Despite the increasing use of the human security concept in the EU's security management, it is still not embedded in defense and security policy structures. In crisis times when the EU practices conflict resolutions, interventions, human rights violations, the policy adaptation still cannot cover the human security side.

Den Boer, Monica. "Juggling the Balance between Preventive Security and Human Rights in Europe." *Security and Human Rights* **26, no. 2-4 (2015): 126–46.**

This article mainly discusses the development of preventive security logic in the European Union agenda, and it gives an overview of how it becomes more mainstream in policymaking. Although this research does not directly address the human security issue, it reflects human rights developments in the European Union and how this normative framework can impact the European Union's

preventive security agenda.

Kaldor, Mary, Mary Martin, and Sabine Selchow. "Human Security: A New Strategic Narrative for Europe." *International Affairs* **83, no. 2 (2007): 273-88.**

In this article, the authors argue that there is a lack of normative action in the security policies of the EU as a global actor and how human security offers a change in the existing security dimensions of Europe. However, the foundational ideas of human security policy, such as respect for human rights, multilateralism, bottom-up approach, offer a way to close this security gap in the normative side of contemporary global security.

Matlary, Janne Haaland. "Much Ado about Little: The EU and Human Security." *International Affairs* **84, no. 1 (2008): 131-43.**

The author shows how the European Union's security discourse is an "add-on" to the national security agendas of member states and discusses that this does not alter the EU's position as a security actor. The main purpose of this work is to analyze whether the concept of human security is the underlying element of the European Security and Defense Policy or it is just a trendy term.

Paris, Roland. "Human Security: Paradigm Shift or Hot Air?." *International Security* **26, no. 2 (Fall 2001): 87-102.**

In this seminal article on human security, Roland gives an insight into the existing definitions of human security and shows how these definitions are limited for policymaking and research. This article explores the evolution of human security and how it reflects on the overall understanding of the security concept.

Richmond, Oliver P. [“Emancipatory Forms of Human Security and Liberal Peacebuilding.”](#)*International Journal* **62, no. 3 (2007): 459-78.**

This article explains two dimensions of human security from institutional and emancipatory approaches and the impact of human security on liberal peacebuilding. Even though the arguments suggest that the concept of human security is characterized by the institutional approach, what matters, in the end, is the emancipation of individuals. Moreover, it is argued that peacebuilding in liberal states could give an insight into the human security problem in conflict areas.

***

***** ***** ***** *****

***

3. Military Threats in Europe – Sitare Nuriye Kurdeş

Akgül Açıkmeşe, Sinem, and Cihan Dizdaroğlu. "NATO-AB İlişkilerinde İşbirliği Dinamikleri." In *[NATO-AB İlişkileri: İşbirliği ve Çatışma Dinamikleri](#)*, 49-53. İstanbul: İstanbul Bilgi Üniversitesi Yayınları, 2013.

This seminal book chapter presents a descriptive and partly comparative analysis of the European Union and the NATO relations in the context of the "hard power" concept. It explains the historical evolution of the relations in the light of cooperation and conflict dynamics, and NATO as the "back-up military – defense guard" of the European Union. Moreover, the authors clarify the underlying reasons for Berlin Plus, Petersberg Tasks, and transatlantic relations of the European Union in military security terms.

Buzan, Barry. "The Changing Agenda of Military Security." In *[Globalization and Environmental Challenges: Reconceptualizing Security in the 21st Century.](#)* **Hexagon Series on Human and Environmental Security and Peace, Vol. 3, edited by Hans Günter Brauch, Úrsula Oswald Spring, Czeslaw Mesjasz, John Grin, Pál Dunay, Navnita Chadha Behera, Béchir Chourou, Patricia Kameri-Mbote, P. H. Liotta, 553-60. Berlin: Springer, 2008.**

Buzan, Barry. [_"Askeri Güvenliğin Değişen Gündemi."_](#) Çev. Burcu Yavuz. *Uluslararası İlişkiler* **5, no. 18 (2008): 107-23.**

In this article, Buzan argues that military security is the ability of governments to maintain themselves against external and internal military threats. However, it is seen that the understanding of security has changed after the Cold War. In other words, during the post-Cold War era, changes in the international system, such as the emergence of new states and security dynamics were seen, and Europe's power was challenged. Hence, Buzan argues how military security has evolved during this period in the light of securitization, de-securitization, and the war on terrorism after 9/11. He evaluates 9/11 as the turning point for the evolution of the concept of military security.

Dwan, Renata, and Zdzislaw Lachowski. 2003. [_"The Military and Security Dimensions of the European Union."_](#) In *SIPRI Yearbook 2003: Armaments, Disarmament and International Security*, **213-36. Stockholm: Stockholm International Peace Research Institute, 2003.**

In this research, Dwan and Lachowski focus on the security dimensions in the light of the military security of Europe, mainly based on the post-cold war dimensions. It includes transatlantic relations as well as Europe and explains the European Union's relations and cooperations with NATO in the context of post-dissolution and 9/11 attacks in the European Security and Defense Policy. Hence, it also reflects the European Union's incapability both in political and military terms.

Jindal, Nirmal. "Changing Dimensions of National Security." *India Quarterly* 58, no. 3-4 (2002): 93-112.

The United States of America mainly uses the "National security" concept in the meaning of the "military" concept of Security Studies. The article examines military security issues in the United States of America and its evolution starting from the Cold War. Moreover, it states changes in the issue, especially since 9/11. Besides the Cold War's realistic dynamics, while analyzing 9/11, Jindal gives a neo-conservative practice of George W. Bush's administration policies.

Howorth, Jolyon. *Security and Defense Policy in the European Union,* 33-57; 92-133. Houndmills: Palgrave Macmillan, 2007.

These book chapters provide a general framework on the European Union's security and defense policies since its establishment, arguing that the European Union entered the world stage as a "new security actor." These chapters might be an excellent start to understanding today's security dynamics because it explains both the historical evolution of the Union and experienced military operations with NATO.

Manners, Ian. "Normative Power Europe: A Contradiction in Terms?." *Journal of Common Market Studies* 40, no. 2 (2002): 235-58.

In order to understand the European Union's military security dimensions, it is significant to answer the question of "what kind of power the European Union is? Manners analyses the European Union whether it is a normative power, civilian power, or military power. Thus, the author examines underlying reasons within this context while finding answers.

Marrone, Alessandro. "Permanent Structured Cooperation: An Institutional Pathway for European Defence." *IAI Commentaries* 17, no.

26 (November 2017): 1-5.

The article draws an excellent and descriptive framework of the European Union's attempt to create an instrument for its military security, such as Permanent Structured Cooperation (PESCO). Marrone explains how PESCO has been established in the light of post-cold War threats, and the "war against terrorism" was emerged by the United States of America after the 9/11 attacks. Besides, its effects on European security, its objectives, and possible effects on the European Defence are analyzed within the descriptive method.

Szenes, Zoltán. ["Military Security Today. New Threats, New Wars, New Theories."](#) In *Security Challenges in the 21st Century*, edited by Geza Finszter and Istvan Sabjanics, 69-105. Budapest: Dialog Campus Publishing, 2016.

The military concept of security has been evaluated differently and changed in the context of the agenda of the international system. Szenes draws a framework on defining military security, the challenges to the concept, and conceptual theories to understand it after 9/11. According to Szenes, conceptualizing theory is mainly based on realism but gives other theories a way to analyze today's terms. Moreover, the research includes a depth-literature review on new war theories and new concepts on military security.

Tardy, Thierry. ["Does European defence really matter? Fortunes and misfortunes of the Common Security and Defence Policy."](#) *European Security* 27, no. 2 (2018): 119-37.

Tardy approaches the European defense policies within the critical approach as if there is a need for a particular European self-defense policy or European army in light of the European Union's failures on the concept. The author draws a framework on the capacity of Common Security and Defense Policy and its tendency to be a "security" policy rather than a defense policy because defense

remains the "poor relative" of the policy era. In this context, Tardy argues that establishing the new policy era, new co-operations, and institutions play a role in the security and defense in the European Union.

***** ***** ***** *****

4. Migration and Security in Europe – Yaren Ünlü

Bigo, Didier. ["Security and immigration: Toward a critique of the governmentality of unease."](#)*Alternatives*** 27, no. 1 (2002): 63-92.**

The article belongs to one of the leading scholars of the Paris School, Didier Bigo, and he presents a critical perspective towards the securitization of immigration by analyzing political and bureaucratic interaction within a state. It is a significant study since he takes the issue as a mode of governmentality by various institutions that hide their failures by acting as a protector of the state against migration threats.

Castles, Stephen. ["International migration at the beginning of the twenty-first century: Global trends and issues."](#) *International Social Science Journal* **52, no. 165 (2000): 269–81.**

Studies of the author, one of the prominent scholars in the migration field, are very significant in understanding the importance of the migration phenomenon and its place in the world scene. In this article, Castles presents the development of the phenomenon in the twenty-first century by giving detailed features of

migration such as its definition, causes, development, and by touching upon its security perception by the actors.

Ceyhan, Ayse, and Anastassia Tsoukala. "The securitization of migration in western societies: Ambivalent discourses and policies." *Alternatives* 27, Special Issue (2002): 21–39.

As one of the leading articles in literature, the authors question why migration has become a first-ranked issue in Western Societies and why it has been connoted with poverty, crime, etc., in the last twentieth century. They explain it by stressing the importance of discourses on migration which produces fear, chaos in the Western countries, and threat for the "identity" of Western societies.

Elitok, Seçil Paçacı. "Three Years on: An Evaluation of the EU-Turkey Refugee Deal."

MiReKoc Working Papers, Istanbul, 2019.

As a recent paper, it carries significance due to its approach to the migration crisis in 2015 and its evaluation of three years on the relationship between the EU and Turkey regarding the crisis. It presents a broad understanding of the Syrian Refugee Crisis and helps us understand how the actors, in this case of the EU and Turkey, frame it as a security issue and what they do to cope with the issue.

Faist, Thomas. "The migration-security nexus: International migration and security before and after 9/11." In *Migration, Citizenship, Ethnos*, edited by Y. Michal Bodemann and Gökçe Yurdakul, 103-19. New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2006.

It is a valuable book chapter since the author gives a historical background of the

relationship between migration and security by comprehending both periods before and after 9/11, which can be considered a turning point for understanding migration as a security issue in world politics. It explains the migration-security nexus by looking at the impact of 9/11 in the world.

Huysmans, Jef. "The European Union and the securitization of migration." *Journal of Common Market Studies* 38, no. 5 (2000): 751–77.

In this article, Huysmans gives a comprehensive framework of the development of migration as a security issue and its effects on European integration and European Union migration policies. The author examines its construction politically and its links with crimes. Moreover, he indicates cultural security, the relation between welfare, security, and migration.

Huysmans, Jef, and Vicki Squire. "Migration and security." In *The Routledge Handbook of Security Studies*, **edited by Myriam Dunn Cavelty and Thierry Balzacq, 169-79. London, UK: Routledge, 2009.**

In this book chapter, Huysmans and Squire present two perspectives on the migration-security nexus, which are the traditional strategic perspective and human perspective. They also indicate the normative dilemmas constituted by the understanding of migration as a security issue. The authors conclude the article by stressing re-framing the interaction between migration and security.

Neal, Andrew W. "Securitization and risk at the EU border: The origins of Frontex." *Journal of Common Market Studies* 47, no. 2 (2009): 333-56.

This study is significant due to its empirical evidence about the origins of Frontex and its approach to securitization theory regarding its applicability to EU institutions. The author presents the development of Frontex, which is the coastguard of the European Border, and the interaction of Frontex with the

concepts of security and migration. Therefore, Frontex as a rising EU agency and security-migration nexus can be understood through this article.

***** ***** ***** *****

---

5. Border Security in Europe – Abdullah Arslan

Anderson, Ruben. [“Hardwiring the Frontier? The Politics of Security Technology in Europe's 'Fight against Illegal Migration.'”](#) *Security Dialogue* **47, no. 1 (2016): 22–39.**

This article benefits from concepts, ethnographies of borders, sociology of borders, and border security as practices, to analyze what has happened on the Spanish border to tackle migration flows. The author concludes that usage of new technologies/practices (Seahorse and Eurosur) are also productive since they force migrants to try different ways to cross borders which eventually creates new security challenges.

Bigo, Didier. "Death in the Mediterranean Sea: The Results of Three Fields of Action of European Border Controls." In [*The Irregularization of Migration in Contemporary Europe: Detention, Deportation, Drowning*](#), **edited by Yolande Jansen, Robin Celikates, and Joost De Bloois, 55–70. London: Rowman & Littlefield, 2015.**

In this book chapter, a prominent representative of the Paris School, Didier Bigo utilizes the concept, "regimes of truth" regarding border security from a more

sociological approach. The author defines three fields, military practices, internal security practices, and computerized managerial practices, to include different actors. Bigo investigates the relation between the EU technology-driven security approach and danger in the Mediterranean. The author concludes that increased and comprehensive technology usage to protect borders did not create the safe Mediterranean since migrants tend to follow different ways it generates new risks and dangers.

Glouftsios, Georgios. "Governing Circulation through Technology within EU Border Security Practice-Networks." *Mobilities* **13, no. 2 (2018): 185–99.**

This research focuses on how information technologies are utilized within the border security framework by investigating their functionalities while employing Actor-Network Theory and New Materialisms. The paper aims to prove that the employment of certain security experts and technologies causes practically re-performed and re-produced different spaces of territories. The paper argues that there is no stability in practices, surveillance, and information technologies enacting practitioners to act beyond existing danger.

Jeandesboz, Julien. "Smartening Border Security in the European Union: An Associational Inquiry." *Security Dialogue* **47, no. 4 (2016): 292–309.**

This paper focuses on smart borders, computerized systems of border security, and sociotechnical security. The author develops its analysis on a term called dataveillance while focusing on connecting links between control over borders, security market ad handling of information systems.

Mountz, Alison. "In / Visibility and the Securitization of Migration: Shaping Publics Through Border Enforcement on Islands." *Cultural Politics* **11, no. 2 (2015): 184–200.**

This paper focuses on the geographical invisibilities of migrants. In that regard, the paper argues that exclusionary material geographies are hand in hand with speech acts on the securitization of migration. In other words, invisibilities through geographic distancing led to other representations. To investigate this argument, the paper works on the cases of Guam, Saipan, and Lampedusa.

Peoples, Columba and Vaughan-Williams Nick. "Migration and Border Security." In *Critical Security Studies: An Introduction,* 134–48. Oxon and New York: Routledge, 2010.

The authors, in this study, show how migration and border security studies have been evolved together and became much more complex in the last decades. This chapter acts like a textbook that brings explanations on recent developments on border practices and approaches to migration. In that sense, how critical security studies approached securitized relations between borders and immigration are clarified.

Popescu, Gabriel. "Making Sense of Borders." In *Bordering and Ordering the Twenty-First Century: Understanding Borders*, 7-29. Lanham, Boulders, New York, Toronto, Plymouth: Rowman & Littlefield, 2012.

This book chapter provides a comprehensive knowledge on borders and border security understanding. The author describes borders as social phenomena that are constructed by human involvement. In that sense, how borders and border making are in relation with concepts such as power, sovereignty, nation-state building are explained. In addition to that, how border/boundary studies have evolved are described. The author concludes that as a result of the inclusion of different practices, borders/border studies became much more complicated.

Vaughan-Williams, Nick. "Borders, Crises, Critique." In *Europe's Border Crisis: Biopolitical Security and Beyond,* 1-16. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2015.

This book chapter focuses on the link between border security management and the area of freedom, security, and justice. The author shows the hypocrisy in the European Commission reaction to the Lampedusa incident that underlines two concepts, "security" and "humanitarian protection". While doing that paper utilizes the concept "biopolitics" from the Foucauldian approach.

***** ***** ***** *****

6. Disinformation and Security in Europe – İlgi Doğa Albasar

Bennett, W. Lance, and Steven Livingston. "The Disinformation Order: Disruptive Communication and the Decline of Democratic Institutions." *European Journal of Communication* 33, no. 2 (2018): 122-39.

Stating that many western democracies have been facing disinformation waves, it is argued that how radical right parties and foreign actors such as Russia have been using disinformation tools to undermine the credibility of the democratic institutions as well as the elections and governments. Highlighting the widespread disinformation campaigns, this article successfully engaging with the negative impact of disinformation on democratic institutions and its role in spreading radical and extremist views.

European Commission. "Action Plan against Disinformation." JOIN 36, December 2018. *https://eeas.europa.eu/sites/default/files/action_plan_against_disinfo*

rmation.pdf.

Disinformation has been on the agenda of the European Union since 2014. In 2015, the EU Commission acknowledged that disinformation is an important security threat. The EU Commission published in 2018 is the first report regarding the concrete plans on tackling online disinformation. This is your official go-to source regarding the EU's stance against the spread of disinformation in recent years.

Gerrits, André WM. ["Disinformation in International Relations: How Important Is It?."](#) *Security and Human Rights* **29, no. 1-4 (2019): 3-23**

Unlike the recent ongoing trend in literature that focuses on disinformation as a security threat, Gerrits takes a more skeptical approach and questions the place of disinformation in International Relations. Drawing examples from the events like "Macron leaks" and "Brexit", it is argued that the international disinformation campaigns do not create security challenges to the point that it alters the international power balance.

Herrera, Janaína, Marine Guillaume, Alexandre Escorcia, and Jean-Baptiste Jeangène Vilmer. ["Information Manipulation: A Challenge for Our Democracies."](#) Report by the Policy Planning Staff (CAPS) of the Ministry for Europe and Foreign Affairs and the Institute for Strategic Research (IRSEM) of the Ministry for the Armed Forces, Paris, 2018.

This study is one of the most comprehensive bodies of works regarding the issue of disinformation. In this seminal work, the authors approach the issue both from the individual and collective levels. Diving into how the disinformation campaigns are carried out by different tools such as bots, trolls, and leaks, the final chapter focuses on a particular case study of Macron Leaks. This book is definitely your friend if you want to do your own research on disinformation.

Ia Cour, Christina. ["Theorising Digital Disinformation in International Relations."](#) *International Politics* 57 (2020): 704–23.

Starting with the claim that none of the current International Relations theories can fully explain the phenomenon of international digital disinformation, la Cour tests three different case studies with three different theoretical frameworks put forward by E.H Carr, John J. Mearsheimer, and Joseph S. Nye. While these three perspectives make the issue of disinformation more comprehensible, la Cour calls that the field of International Relations needs a much more comprehensive theoretical approach regarding digital disinformation.

Ignatidou, Sophia. *[EU – US Cooperation on Tackling Disinformation.](#)* London: Chatham House, 2019.

Providing you with the necessary context regarding the disinformation topic, this research paper makes an excellent summary regarding the countermeasures used by EU institutions and EU member states against the recent digital disinformation campaigns. The chapter concerning the cooperation opportunities and challenges between the EU and the US makes this paper a perfect beginner guide for those who want to get acclimated to the issue of disinformation.

Monsees, Linda. ["'A War against Truth' – Understanding the Fake News Controversy."](#) *Critical Studies on Security* 8, no. 2 (2020): 116–29.

Instead of taking the notion that disinformation controversy is a security concern at face value, this suggesting a different perspective, approaching the issue from smaller controversies to show that how those smaller controversies such as xenophobia, the digital media, and Russian disinformation campaigns are tied to each other through the German case study. One of the important arguments of the article is that perceiving disinformation controversy as a core security threat may have negative effects on genuine journalism.

Vériter, Sophie L., Corneliu Bjola, and Joachim A. Koops. ["Tackling Covid-19 Disinformation: Internal and External Challenges for the European Union."](#) *The Hague Journal of Diplomacy* **15, no. 4 (2020): 569–82.** Emphasizing that the ongoing COVID-19 Pandemic is not only a global health concern but also a disinformation crisis, this article addresses the disinformation threat and challenges that the European Union is facing through the conspiracy theories that emerged during the COVID-19 process and the disinformation campaigns implemented by China. It is argued that the future of Europe in terms of maintaining stability in the face of such challenges is tied to the EU's ability to come up with appropriate mechanisms.

Vilson, Maili. ["The Europeanization of Foreign Policy in the Face of the Russian Disinformation War."](#) *Sõjateadlane (Estonian Journal of Military Studies)* **2 (2016): 114-40**

This article examines the reaction of the EU and its member states against the disinformation campaign carried out by Russia that started in the Ukraine crisis, which targeted not only Ukraine but also the EU and the West. Employing the process-tracing method, it is shown how EU member states are in favor of developing a collective response at the EU level against the Russian disinformation campaign. While this article is a little bit outdated, it still provides a valuable information regarding the initial reaction of the EU.

Zimmermann, Fabian, and Matthias Kohring. ["Mistrust, Disinforming News, and Vote Choice: A Panel Survey on the Origins and Consequences of Believing Disinformation in the 2017 German Parliamentary Election."](#) *Political Communication* **37, no. 2 (2020): 215-37.**

By employing a quantitative method, this article analyzes whether digital disinformation really has the power to affect the elections through the case study of the 2017 German parliamentary elections. The analysis shows that disinformation campaigns are indeed effective as people who believe in disinforming news are likely to vote for the populist right-wing party (AFD)

instead of the government party (CDU / CSU). It is shown that there is a negative correlation between believing the disinforming news and having confidence in the media and political institutions.

***** ***** ***** *****

7. Ecological Security Issues in Europe – Erman Ermihan and Sezen Kaya

Atvur, Senem, and İnan Rüma. *"Ekolojik Güvenlik: Hayati Tehdit."* *Güvenlik Yazıları Serisi,* no. 25, October 2019. https://trguvenlikportali.com/wp-content/uploads/2019/11/EkolojikGuvenlik_SenemAtvurInanRuma_v.1.pdf.

In this brief literature review, the authors provide a general framework for the transition of academic studies from environmental security to ecological security. Starting from the 1970s, as the growing ecological risks became a severe danger for the planet, the number of extreme weather events increased and affected multiple areas of life. For this reason, Atvur and Rüma suggest multiple key academic works on the increasing importance of ecological security.

Bardazzi, Rosella, Maria Grazia Pazienza and Alberto Tonini. "Enhancing European Energy and Climate Security: Eastern Strategic Partners, Unconventional Sources and Public Policies." In *European Energy and Climate Security: Public Policies, Energy Sources, and Eastern Partners,* 1-12. Switzerland: Springer, 2016.

This seminal book and the relevant book chapter help understand the nexus between European climate and energy security. Being an introductory chapter to the book, the authors highlight the significance of the European Energy Security Strategy adopted in 2014. They also touch upon the close relationship between energy security and climate security, as pursuing the former may harm the latter. In this case, the priority of renewable energy might be critical for Europe for its 2030 and 2050 goals.

Burns, Charlotte, Peter Eckersley, and Paul Tobin. [“EU environmental policy in times of crisis.”](#)*Journal of European Public Policy* **27, no. 1 (2020): 1-19.**

This study offers a contemporary understanding of the EU's recent environmental policy since it has been going through severe changes in the last ten years. The legislative analysis is combined with elite interviews. The main finding of the study is that although the environmental ambition of the EU decreased after the 2008-09 financial crisis, the EU's ambitions persist with some backlash. Firstly, the former members who pushed for a more solid environmental policy are no longer pioneering. Secondly, member states are becoming more prominent, which decreases the EU's international role.

McDonald, Matt. [“Discourses of climate security.”](#) *Political Geography* **33 (2013): 42-51.**

In this milestone study, McDonald takes on the relationship between climate change and security through discourses. Firstly, the author observes the actor whose security is at risk. Secondly, McDonald looks into the ones who are responsible for responding to a climate threat. Furthermore, it is also important to define the threat at hand. In addition, what would be the alternative responses to deal with that threat? After analyzing each of these questions, McDonald argues that the powerful discourses about climate security cannot pose an effective answer to climate change.

McDonald, Matt. **"Ecological Security."** E-International Relations, November 28, 2015. https://www.e-ir.info/2015/11/28/ecological-security/.

This short piece by McDonald provides a brief literature review on ecological security. Similar to their 2013 article, McDonald underlines the importance of discourses in ecological security. The very ethical concerns in the age of Anthropocene necessitate the linkage between climate change and security. However, the author touches upon the dilemma of this linkage because the complexity of the situation brings the question of human intervention in nature and states' lack of cooperation.

McDonald, Matt. **"Climate change and security: towards ecological security?."** *International Theory* 10, no.2 (2018): 153-180.

This seminal article examines whether it is beneficial to think about climate change and security through ecological security by focusing on discourses. It is a valuable article that mainly analyzes ecological security different from other research in environmental security. McDonald suggests that if security is understood around contestation and discourses. The author proposes observing the organizations and actors that are most prominent in the ethical stance and practices about climate change.

Pirages, Dennis C. "Ecological security: a conceptual framework." **In** *Environmental Security: Approaches and Issues*, **edited by Rita Floyd and Richard A. Matthew, 139-53. London and New York: Routledge, 2013.**

Pirages offers an often-cited conceptual framework to comprehend ecological security. In this book chapter, the author outlines several challenges in studying ecological security, such as people's faster mobility facilitated by globalization, demographic changes, and China and India's rapid industrial rise. In this framework, this chapter is significant since it uses the concept of ecological security independently from the concept of environmental security. Pirages

associates ecological security with human security, which makes it the successor of environmental security.

Timoshenko, Alexandre S. **"Ecological Security: Global Change Paradigm."** *Colorado Journal of International Environmental Law and Policy* **1 (1990): 127-46.**

Timoshenko's work represents one of the earliest studies that analyze ecological security. As the author notes, environmental problems pose severe risks for humankind. If common principles of ecological security bind states, some common solutions could be found. The author offers ten solutions provided by the principles of ecological security, mainly focusing on cooperation and enforcement measures.

Trombetta, Maria Julia. **"Environmental security and climate change: analysing the discourse."** *Cambridge Review of International Affairs* **21, no. 4 (2008): 585-602.**

Trombetta's article offers a milestone study of the relations between environmental issues and security. The study challenges the mainstream understanding of securitization by the Copenhagen School and observes how environmental issues and climate change challenged the existing security practices. The securitization approach developed by the Copenhagen School is argued to be fixed and dominated by the realist tradition. However, as this article shows, environmental security and climate change are much more reflexive and contextual.

***** ***** ***** *****

8. Cyber Security in Europe – Şeyma Yeşilyurt

Bendiek, Annegret. "[European Cyber Security Policy.](#) *SWP Research Paper*, Berlin: Stiftung Wissenschaft und Politik -SWP- Deutsches Institut für Internationale Politik und Sicherheit, 2012.**

This article offers a little more in-depth information and tries to show how compatible the measures taken by the European Union on cybersecurity are with democracy and human rights. Putting forward a study on how to improve cybersecurity without violation of democratic principles offers a different perspective extensively.

Carrapico, Helena and André Barrinha. ["The EU as a coherent (cyber) security actor?."](#) *JCMS: Journal of Common Market Studies* **55, no. 6 (2017): 1254-72.**

As one of the main articles on the issue of security and the EU, this article describes how the European Union acts in the context of the issue of cybersecurity. The article clarifies whether the EU is a security actor and how effective it is in cybersecurity with the explanations of the EU's cybersecurity policies. The authors draw a framework to analyze the coherence of the EU as a security participant and apply it to the field of cybersecurity. By focusing on the EU's cybersecurity policy, this article explores whether the EU can be seen as a coordinated participant in this field or whether the policy is being enforced for different and uncoordinated reasons.

Carrapico, Helena, and Farrand, Benjamin. ["Discursive continuity and change in the time of Covid-19: the case of EU cybersecurity policy."](#) *Journal of European Integration* **42, no. 8 (2020): 1111-26.**

This article evaluates the changing and evolving cybersecurity policies of the COVID-19 periods with historical and discursive institutionalism theories. The article explores the extent of COVID-19's impact on the trajectory of EU cybersecurity policy. The authors emphasize that the Covid-19 crisis has led to an unprecedented reliance on digital solutions, from telecommuting to virus tracking systems, leading to the spread of Covid-19-related cybercrimes, attacks on information infrastructure, pandemic criticism, and misinformation.

Cavelty, Myriam Dunn. "Cyber-Security." In _Handbook of new security studies, edited by J. Peter Burgess_, 154-83. London and New York: Routledge, 2010.

In this article, the author refers to the different clusters and the definition of cybersecurity. The historical analysis he provided with this article is critical for understanding how this issue has shaped in time. The author explains how the concept has a strange framework conceptually and theoretically. Moreover, the article focuses on the questions of what security is, how it is practiced, and how we can theoretically approach the concept of cybersecurity. While doing this, the author enriched the issue with various examples from the 1970s,80s, and 90s.

Council of the European Union. "Cybersecurity: how the EU tackles cyber threats." Last modified April 21, 2021. https://www.consilium.europa.eu/en/policies/cybersecurity/.

It is essential to look at the European Union's concrete work on cybersecurity and the EU's official website on Cybersecurity Policies to understand what they do and what they will do in the future. What are the actors regarding cybersecurity? Therefore, this source is important to show how the EU tackles cyber threats.

Craigen, Dan, Nadia Diakun-Thibault, and Randy Purse. "Defining cybersecurity." _Technology Innovation Management Review_ 3, no. 10 (2014): 13-21.

This article, which is essential with its main narrative style and other explanations defined in the literature, is a simple and comprehensive text for the definition of cybersecurity. The writer has conducted many discussions on cybersecurity with different professionals, academics, and graduate students to examine what should be included in the description of cybersecurity from multiple angles. Therefore, this study is one of the essential sources to understand the concept of cybersecurity since it presents a broad definition to the reader.

European Commission. ["Cybersecurity Policies."](#) Last modified June 8, 2021. https://digital-strategy.ec.europa.eu/en/policies/cybersecurity-policies.

It presents the EU's cybersecurity policies in detail. This source is significant for understanding the EU's cybersecurity policies because it explains its strategies, legislation, and different kinds of cyber policy areas. For example, it emphasizes securing the electoral process, Women4Cyber, Cyber diplomacy, and the EU cybersecurity agency. Hence, it is one of the primary sources in this issue.

Cavelty, Myriam Dunn, and Andreas Wenger. ["Cyber security meets security politics: Complex technology, fragmented politics, and networked science."](#) *Contemporary Security Policy* **41, no. 1 (2020): 5-32.**

This article offers a different approach; technology, politics, science, the evolution of cybersecurity politics constitute the main elements of the six drivers required. Indeed, the factors revealed when evaluating today are the most important actors of the cybersecurity issue. In line with the argument put forward by the author, new governance is required in the face of events regarding cybersecurity. It is possible with six drivers from the fields of technology, politics, and science that have been influential in the evolution of cybersecurity politics and how it is studied.

***** ***** ***** *****

9. Economic Security in Europe – Sitare Nuriye Kurdeş

Amadeo, Kimberly. ["Eurozone Debt Crisis."](#) The Balance, November 16, 2020. https://www.thebalance.com/eurozone-debt-crisis-causes-cures-and-consequences-3305524.

As it is not an academic article, it provides a non-governmental and promotive approach to the European debt crisis. Amadeo explains the weaknesses of the European Union and the lack of governance in the Union during the crisis and pre-crisis policies from the citizen and economist perspectives. It provides an important reading on the European debt crisis. Although it was published in 2020, it covers previous and new threats and events on Europe's financial solidarity.

Cable, Vincent. ["What is Economic Security?."](#) *International Affairs* 71, no. 2 (1995): 305-24

After the Cold War, with the improvement of Security Studies, economic security has become an important concept. Due to the emergence of new states and race between the West and Russia to get them into the "capitalist club," Cable's study is significant because it provides an explanation of the concept of "economic security" for the first time. It has presented the economic system and its threats since the 1990s.

Denoon, David PH. "Economics and National Security: The Dangers of Overcommitment." In *The Global Century: Globalization and National Security*, edited by Richard L. Kugler and Ellen L. Forest, 241-57. University Press of the Pacific, 2001.

Denoon's study provides an important approach to economic security studies as it approaches the issue from a "national security" lens. It has provided the linkage between national security and economic security on the traditional security issues as it has published after the 9/11 attacks and built on a realistic approach. It is a significant article to underline both the possible threats from the overcommitment between economics and national security and the linkage between them.

Economist. "A very short history of the crisis." Last modified November 12, 2011. https://www.economist.com/special-report/2011/11/12/a-very-short-history-of-the-crisis.

As the article is non-academic and journalism-based, it provides the non-governmental approach to the Eurozone Crisis on an economic approach. It clarifies the crisis from the very start to end, criticizing the internal and external factors on the external lens. It reports clearly and understandably the European Union's monetary crisis.

Fuest, Clemens and Andreas Peichl. "EU Fiscal Union? What is it? Does this work? And are there really 'no alternatives'?." *IZA Policy Papers* 39, Bonn, 2012.

As the European Union's main success was based on its economic benefits during its Golden Years, this study provides what exactly the European Economic Union is. It offers descriptive expression on its full perspectives while also approaches the European Economic Union through a critical lens at the end. Moreover, the study clarifies the importance of the European Economic Union by listing the

"possible" alternatives and compares them with the European Union's economic system.

Mesjasz, Czeslaw. "Economic Security." In _Globalization and Environmental Challenges: Reconceptualizing Security in the 21st Century._ Hexagon Series on Human and Environmental Security and Peace, Vol. 3, edited by Hans Günter Brauch, Úrsula Oswald Spring, Czeslaw Mesjasz, John Grin, Pál Dunay, Navnita Chadha Behera, Béchir Chourou, Patricia Kameri-Mbote, P. H. Liotta, 569-80. Berlin: Springer, 2008.

Mesjasz, Czeslaw "Ekonomik Güvenlik." Çev. Yelda Demirağ. _Uluslararası İlişkiler Dergisi_ 5, no. 18 (Yaz, 2008): 125-50.

Arguing the importance of the economy for people, Mesjasz's study provides the most descriptive analysis on economic security in the literature. The study provides a theoretical examination of the economic extent of human and security practices while providing ties between economy and security dividedly. It touches upon the securitization of the economy with a level analysis as state analysis, individual analysis, national and international analysis of economic security. In conclusion, within a touch of globalization and its possible effects on economic security, Mesajsz's work provides an essential introduction reading to Security Studies with the economic approach.

Pinder, John. "European Economic Security: How Can We Master the Modern Economy?."_International Journal_ 40, no. 1 (1984): 128-44

As the European Union has lived its "golden years" during the 1970s and 1980s as a "European Economic Community," this study, which is written and published in the 1980s, demonstrates the security approach to the European Economic Community with underlining the new global economic system as "modern economy". It highlights "what should be done" to keep up with the new modern

economy. Moreover, the article is important to read since it helps to compare what was evaluated as a threat during the golden years and what was advised, and which one of them has applied.

Pisani-Ferry, Jean and Guntram Wolff, [**"The threats to the European Union's economic sovereignty."**](#) *Policy Paper*, **2019.**

Wolf and Pisani's study on the threats to the European Union's economic security provides significant research on the European Political Economic literature. It approaches the security threat issue to the European Union from an economic perspective and provides a "hybrid threat" explanation to the European Union's security. As the study is recent, it offers previous challenges to the European Economic Security and what would be in the future on realistic approach.

Whyte, Philip. [**"Governance Reforms have left the Euro's Flawed Structure Intact."**](#) **Centre for European Form, April 18, 2012. https://www.cer.eu/insights/governance-reforms-have-left-euros-flawed-structure-intact.**

Within the devastating impacts of the European Union's monetary crisis, Whyte's study explains the circumstances of the Eurozone crisis. It is a critical approach to the European Union's monetary crisis and clarifies the reasons, impacts, and lack of policies that caused the crisis. The study also explains the weaknesses and flaws of the Economic and Monetary Union of the European Union and what is expected in the future on the issue.

---

*This annotated bibliography is prepared by the graduate students of the class on Hybrid Security in the EU at Kadir Has University as part of the course requirements. This course is delivered as part of the activities of Jean Monnet

---

Sezen Kaya, Doktora Öğrencisi, Kadir Has Üniversitesi

Sezen Kaya is currently pursuing her Ph.D. in International Relations at Kadir Has University. She has completed undergraduate and graduate degrees in International Relations at Çukurova University. Her research interests focus on environmental security, climate security, climate change, and Copenhagen School.